2014-2015 Graduate Council
Meeting Agenda: September 17, 2014 | 3:30 p.m.–5:00 p.m. | 102 Kern Graduate Building
Coffee available: 3:10 p.m.

1. Minutes of the May 7, 2014, Meeting
2. Communications to Graduate Council
3. Announcements/Remarks by the Chair - Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School, Chair of Graduate Council
4. Reports of Standing Committees of Graduate Council
   a) Committee on Committees and Procedures – David Spencer, Chair
      Item for discussion/vote (Appendix A):
      1) Nominations for 2014–2015 Graduate Council Standing Committees
   b) Committee on Programs and Courses – Joan Redwing, Chair
      Informational items (Appendices B and B1):
      1) Graduate Council Curriculum Report, 9/10/2014 (Appendix B)
      2) World Campus Governance Flow Chart (Appendix B1)
   c) Committee on Academic Standards – Chair
      Items for discussion/vote (Appendices C and D):
      1) Proposed revisions to the Graduate Council policy regarding dual-title graduate degree programs (Appendix C)
      2) Proposed new criteria and guidelines for membership in the Graduate Faculty (Appendix D)
   d) Committee on Fellowships and Awards – Krista Wilkinson, Chair
   e) Committee on Graduate Research – David Spencer, Chair
   f) Committee on Graduate Student and Faculty Issues – Roger Finke, Chair
5. Reports of Special Committees
   a) Graduate School’s Graduate Exhibition Committee – Suzanne Adair, Assistant Dean for Graduate Student Affairs
6. Special Reports
   a) Graduate and Professional Student Association
7. Unfinished Business
8. New Business
9. Comments and Recommendations for the Good of the Graduate Community
2013–2014 Graduate Council
Minutes of the Meeting: May 7, 2014

Graduate Council met on Wednesday, May 7, 2014, at 3:30 p.m. in 102 Kern Graduate Building. Dr. Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School, chaired the meeting. The minutes of the meeting of April 16, 2014, were approved.

Communications to Graduate Council
None.

Announcements/Remarks by the Chair
None.

Reports of Standing Committees of Graduate Council

Committee on Programs and Courses
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. Adriana [Janet] van Hell, who reported on behalf of Dr. Christina Grozinger, Chair, Committee on Programs and Courses.

Dr. van Hell presented one informational item to Council on behalf of the Committee on Programs and Courses:

Graduate Council Curriculum Report, 4/30/2014 – Appendix A

Committee on Academic Standards
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. Jon Nussbaum, Chair, Committee on Academic Standards. Dr. Nussbaum presented to Council for discussion/vote one item on behalf of the Committee, with a motion and a second to approve: proposed new criteria and guidelines for membership in the Graduate Faculty (Appendix B). Dr. Vasilatos-Younken also introduced Dr. Denise Solomon, former associate dean for research and graduate education in the College of the Liberal Arts and chair of the Ad Hoc Subcommittee for Graduate Faculty Membership that examined the current Graduate Faculty membership criteria and nomination process and submitted a report of recommendations for revision to the Committee on Academic Standards, which the Committee used as a foundation, with further refinement, for the proposed new criteria and guidelines for membership brought to Graduate Council. The Ad Hoc Subcommittee shared their draft recommendations and sought feedback from the Advisory Committee for Graduate Education (ACGE) and the Senate Committee on Research (SCOR), prior to submission to the Graduate Council Committee on Academic Standards.

Following discussion of the proposed changes and their impact on current and future membership in the Graduate Faculty, Council tabled this agenda item until the September 2014 Graduate Council meeting to allow Council members more time to discuss the proposed revisions with their respective programs and colleges/schools.

A question was raised regarding the following passage in the proposed policy statement:

“Note - Graduate students are NOT eligible for nomination to the Graduate Faculty (any category) and
are not allowed to teach graduate (500, 600, or 800)-level courses. This includes, for example, running laboratory sections, providing feedback/answering questions, leading discussions, or grading papers or examinations related to graduate courses."

Dr. Nussbaum and Dr. Vasilatos-Younken stressed that this is not proposed new policy, but is taken directly from the current guidelines for Graduate Faculty membership at http://www.gradsch.psu.edu/index.cfm/policies/faculty/criteria/. A small editorial update to clarify what constitutes a graduate course (i.e., addition of 800-level courses) and a change in the placement of this statement within the larger policy are proposed. All units offering graduate courses already should be in compliance with this policy (i.e., only members of the Graduate Faculty may teach graduate courses and graduate students may not be appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty. Otherwise, academic units must obtain permission for someone who is not a member of the Graduate Faculty to teach a graduate course from the dean of the Graduate School/dean’s designee).

Committee on Committees and Procedures
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken reported on behalf of Dr. Kenneth Davis, Chair, Committee on Committees and Procedures.

Dr. Vasilatos-Younken reminded Council members that one item had been presented for online voting prior to the meeting: Election of new members for the 2014–2015 Committee on Committees and Procedures. Dr. Vasilatos-Younken announced the following results of the election: newly elected Graduate Faculty members to serve two-year terms on the Committee on Committees and Procedures are Mary Jane De Souza (College of Health and Human Development), Marie Hojnacki (College of the Liberal Arts), and Matthew Poehner (College of Education); the newly elected graduate student member to serve a one-year term on the Committee is Brad Sottile (Graduate Student in Aerospace Engineering).

Committee on Fellowships and Awards
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. Robert Edwards, Chair, Committee on Fellowships and Awards.

Dr. Edwards reported that the Committee had not met since the last meeting of Council but has been continuing the approval process for two awards.

Committee on Graduate Research
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. David Spencer, Chair, Committee on Graduate Research.

Dr. Spencer reported that the Senate Committee on Research (SCOR) recently met and that Interim Vice President for Research Neil Sharkey introduced the Penn State Fund for Innovation, which will offer grants from $50,000 to $100,000 to faculty for entrepreneurial start-up projects. While the program is designed for faculty, Dr. Spencer said that graduate students can participate in the projects and encouraged Council members to learn more about the fund on the Office of the Vice President for Research website (www.research.psu.edu).

Committee on Graduate Student and Faculty Issues
Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. Lori Francis, Chair, Committee on Graduate Student and Faculty Issues.

Dr. Francis reported that the two subgroups of the Committee had met the previous week and are continuing their initiatives on developing professional development activities and mentoring opportunities for graduate students. The subgroup focused on professional development has sketched out a tentative program for the workshop that centers on career opportunities for graduate students, scheduled to be held October 18, 2014. The subgroup focused on mentoring has drafted a proposal for a donor and will continue working on the project.

Reports of Special Committees

Graduate School’s Graduate Exhibition Subcommittee

Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Dr. Suzanne Adair, who reported on behalf of Dr. Libby Tisdell, Graduate Council liaison to the Graduate School’s Graduate Exhibition Subcommittee.

Dr. Adair reported that the Subcommittee reviewed the 2014 Graduate Exhibition evaluations from both exhibitors and judges and that the feedback was overwhelmingly positive. Some of the recommendations will be taken into consideration as planning for the 2015 Exhibition begins. Dr. Adair also reported that the Subcommittee will continue meeting during the summer months to prepare for the 2015 Exhibition.

Special Reports

Graduate Student Association (GSA)

Dr. Vasilatos-Younken recognized Ms. Katherine Kragh-Buetow, representing the GSA.

Ms. Kragh-Buetow reported that the final general assembly meeting of the GSA 2013–2014 was held last week and that the transition to the new administration/officers was complete. She noted that several of the five new GSA representatives who will serve on Graduate Council for the 2014–2015 academic year were in attendance as guests.

Ms. Kragh-Buetow said that a major concern of the GSA continues to be the proposed changes in health insurance coverage offered to graduate assistants. GSA is hopeful for a favorable resolution through the efforts of the University-wide Student Health Insurance Task Force established by Provost Dr. Nicholas Jones to address this issue.

Unfinished Business

None.

New Business

None.

Comments and Recommendations for the Good of the Graduate Community
None.

Dr. Vasilatos-Younken thanked Council members for their service to graduate education for the 2013–2014 academic year and encouraged members to remain involved and engaged with future matters that come before Council.

There being no further comments or discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:57 p.m.
DATE: September 4, 2014
FROM: David Spencer, Chair, Committee on Committees and Procedures
TO: Graduate Council
VIA: Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School, Chair, Graduate Council
RE: Nominations for 2014–2015 Standing Committees of Graduate Council

Nominations for one-year appointments to standing committees of Graduate Council were made from the 2014–2015 list of Graduate Council elected and additional members and from recommendations from college/school academic leaders. Criteria for making the selections included Council members’ expressions of interest and the maintenance of balanced representation among disciplines and colleges/schools.

The nominees in the following lists were approved by the Committee on Committees and Procedures; the individuals designated as chair were nominated and have indicated their willingness to serve as chair if the committees so agree (except in the case of the Executive Committee, which is chaired by the Graduate Council chair).

The individuals whose names are listed in italics are not nominees to be voted on by Graduate Council members but are appointed to serve according to Graduate Council Bylaws and Standing Rules.

**Executive Committee**
Alan Johnson, Walther H. Ott Professor in Avian Biology (College of Agricultural Sciences)
Seroj Mackertich, Associate Professor of Engineering (Penn State Harrisburg)
Arvind Rangaswamy, Professor of Marketing (Smeal College of Business)

Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Chair, Graduate Council (Interim Dean of the Graduate School)
Caroline Eckhardt, University Faculty Senate Liaison [elected by Faculty Senate] [Currently vacant], Senior Associate Dean of the Graduate School (Ex Officio)

**Chairs of Graduate Council Standing Committees**
- Chair, Academic Standards [to be determined]
- Roger Finke, Chair, Graduate Student and Faculty Issues
- Joan Redwing, Chair, Programs and Courses
- David Spencer, Chair, Graduate Research; Chair, Committees and Procedures
- Krista Wilkinson, Chair, Fellowships and Awards
Committee on Academic Standards
Patrick Drew, Assistant Professor of Neurosurgery (College of Engineering)
L. Sam Finn, Professor of Physics (Eberly College of Science)
Taylor Greer, Associate Professor of Music (College of Arts and Architecture)
James Kasting, Distinguished Professor of Geosciences (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Phillip Laplante, Professor of Software Engineering (Penn State Great Valley)
Denise Meister, Professor of Education (Penn State Harrisburg)
Mary Beth Oliver, Distinguished Professor of Media Studies (College of Communications)

Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School (Ex Officio)
Elizabeth Price, Executive Director of Graduate Education Administration (Ex Officio)
Lori Anne Stania, Director of Graduate Student Services (Ex Officio)

Committee on Fellowships and Awards
Ramaswamy Anantheswaran, Professor of Food Science (College of Agricultural Sciences)
George Anghelcev, Assistant Professor of Communications (College of Communications)
Squire Booker, Associate Professor of Chemistry and BMG (Eberly College of Science)
Harleah [Leah] Buck, Assistant Professor of Nursing (College of Nursing)
Robert Edwards, Edward Erle Sparks Professor (College of the Liberal Arts)
James Fairbank, Associate Professor of Management (Penn State Erie)
Seungjin Kim, Associate Professor of Mechanical Engineering (College of Engineering)
Lynette Kvasny, Associate Professor of Information Sciences and Technology (Information Sciences and Technology)
Anthony Kwasnica, Associate Professor of Business Economics (Smeal College of Business)
Nancy Locke, Associate Professor of Art History (College of Arts and Architecture)
Jonathan Mathews, Associate Professor of Energy and Mineral Engineering (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Sophia McClennen, Professor of Comparative Literature, Spanish and Women's Studies (School of International Affairs)
Matthew Poehner, Associate Professor of Education and Applied Linguistics (College of Education)
Raghvinder Sangwan, Assistant Professor of Software Engineering (Penn State Great Valley)
Stephen Schappe*, Associate Professor of Management (Penn State Harrisburg)
R. Alberto Travagli, Professor of Neural and Behavioral Science (College of Medicine)
Krista Wilkinson (Chair), Professor of Communication Sciences and Disorders (College of Health and Human Development)

Barbara Struble, Director, Graduate Fellowships and Awards Administration (Ex Officio)
Committee on Graduate Research
Mallika Bose, Associate Professor of Landscape Architecture (College of Arts and Architecture)
Robert Brooks, Professor of Meteorology (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Kit Hume, Edwin Erle Sparks Professor of English (College of the Liberal Arts)
Morteza Karimzadeh, Graduate Student in Geography (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Daniel Morgan, Assistant Professor, Department of Anesthesiology (College of Medicine)
Richard Ready, Professor of Agricultural and Environmental Economics (College of Agricultural Sciences)
Benjamin Schreier, Assistant Professor of English and Jewish Studies (College of the Liberal Arts)
David Spencer (Chair), Professor of Aerospace Engineering (College of Engineering)
Richard St. Clair, Associate Professor of Theatre (College of Arts and Architecture)
Jim Thomas, William Elliott Professor of Risk Management (Smeal College of Business)
Feng Yue, Assistant Professor of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology (College of Medicine)

Suzanne Adair, Assistant Dean for Graduate Student Affairs; Director, Office of Postdoctoral Affairs (Ex Officio)

Committee on Graduate Student and Faculty Issues
Sarah Ades, Associate Professor of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology (Eberly College of Science)
Roger Finke (Chair), Professor of Sociology and Religious Studies (College of the Liberal Arts)
Marie Hojnacki, Associate Professor of Political Science (College of the Liberal Arts)
Morteza Karimzadeh, Graduate Student in Geography (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Jeffrey Masko, Graduate Student in Communications (College of Communications)
Peter Molenaar, Distinguished Professor of Human Development and Family Studies (College of Health and Human Development)
Zoubeida Ounaies, Dorothy Quiggle Assistant Professor of Mechanical Engineering (College of Engineering)
Ramesh Ramachandran, Associate Professor of Molecular Endocrinology (College of Agricultural Sciences)
Colleen Unroe, Graduate Student in Rural Sociology (College of Agricultural Sciences)

Suzanne Adair, Assistant Dean for Graduate Student Affairs; Director, Office of Postdoctoral Affairs (Ex Officio)
Philip Burlingame, Assistant Vice President for Student Affairs, Division of Student Affairs (Ex Officio)
Robert Crane, Director, Global Engagement Network, University Office of Global Programs (Ex Officio)
Stephanie Preston, Senior Director, Office of Graduate Educational Equity Programs (Ex Officio)
Paul Simenson, Director, Student Aid Programs, Office of Student Aid (Ex Officio)

Committee on Programs and Courses
Thomas Bowers, Associate Professor of Psychology (Penn State Harrisburg)
Roy Clariana, Professor of Education (College of Education)
Janet Fogg, Assistant Professor (College of Nursing)
Andris Freivalds, Professor of Industrial Engineering (College of Engineering)
Todd LaJeunesse, Associate Professor of Biology (Eberly College of Science)
Lise Nelson, Associate Professor of Women’s Studies and Geography (College of the Liberal Arts)
Joan Redwing (Chair), Professor of Materials Science and Engineering (College of Earth and Mineral Sciences)
Frank Ritter, Professor of Information Sciences and Technology, Psychology, and of Computer Science and Engineering (College of Information Sciences and Technology)
Nathaniel Porter, Graduate Student in Sociology (College of the Liberal Arts)
Jianxun Song, Associate Professor of Microbiology and Immunology (College of Medicine)
Brad Sottile, Graduate Student in Aerospace Engineering (College of Engineering)
Regina Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School (Ex Officio)
Eric Novotny, Acting Head, Arts and Humanities Library and News and Microforms Library (Ex Officio)
Elizabeth Price, Executive Director of Graduate Education Administration (Ex Officio)
Lori Anne Stania, Director, Graduate Student Services (Ex Officio)
Graduate Council Curriculum Report

The Graduate Council Curriculum Report (GCCR), which includes all graduate program curricular proposals approved through the Graduate Council curricular review process, is published 12 times each calendar year.

Questions/comments regarding the GCCR or its contents may be directed to the Executive Director of Graduate Education Administration, Elizabeth Price.

September 10, 2014

No graduate program proposals have been approved through the Graduate Council curricular review process for publication in this edition of the Graduate Council Curriculum Report.

Note: Graduate course proposals approved through the Graduate Council curricular review process, as well as information about postbaccalaureate/graduate credit certificates approved by college/school administrators for graduate education, are published in the Senate Curriculum Report.
Faculty develop proposal with appropriate consultation and submit for college/campus review

Penn State Program Approval Process

**STANDARD CURRICULAR PROCESS**

**WORLD CAMPUS (WC) PROCESS**

**Program Idea**

Circulate Program Idea:
- **Undergraduate**: announce on ACUE listserv
- **Graduate**: submit prospectus to ACGE for distribution within each college/campus with graduate programming

Planning meetings with interested academic partners and WC. Include Graduate and Undergraduate college administrators as needed.

- **Undergraduate**: Submit prospectus to ACUE
- **Graduate**: Submit revised prospectus to ACGE if significant changes from original

Faculty develop proposal with appropriate consultation and submit for college/campus review

**Undergraduate**: Submit P-1 to Faculty Senate Committee on Curricular Affairs or P-3 to the Office of Undergraduate Education

**Graduate**: Submit proposal to Graduate Council Joint Curricular Committee

**Initial WC market scan and map against WC criteria**

Lead Academic Partner completes WC intake form

WC formal market research

WC enrollment and financial analysis

MOA and program rollout

**Timeframe**

- **2 Months**
  - Circulate Program Idea:
    - **Undergraduate**: announce on ACUE listserv
    - **Graduate**: submit prospectus to ACGE for distribution within each college/campus with graduate programming
  - Planning meetings with interested academic partners and WC. Include Graduate and Undergraduate college administrators as needed.
  - **Undergraduate**: Submit prospectus to ACUE
  - **Graduate**: Submit revised prospectus to ACGE if significant changes from original
  - Faculty develop proposal with appropriate consultation and submit for college/campus review

- **2 Months**

- **6 Months**

12 Months Total

Appendix B1
Proposed revisions to the Graduate Council policy regarding dual-title graduate degree programs

Proposed revisions to existing policy (marked with tracked changes)

From the Graduate School’s website:
http://www.gradsch.psu.edu/index.cfm/policies/faculty/dualtitle/

“Dual-Title Graduate Degree Programs

Definition and Policy:

The dual-title degree program is different from a degree program with a minor. A dual-title graduate degree program is more than the addition of valuable coursework (minimally consisting of 15 credits for doctoral degrees and 6 credits for master’s degrees) not currently prescribed in an existing graduate degree program, as occurs with an option or a minor, but rather is a fully integrated program of study that begins with defining a research problem (or other culminating experience, as appropriate to the degree) that integrates both the graduate major and dual-title fields early in the program, and in the case of doctoral students, examining the students’ ability to conduct research in both fields at the first doctoral benchmark: the candidacy examination.

Students must apply and may be admitted to an existing dual-title graduate degree program only after being enrolled in an existing graduate program and, in the case of doctoral students, prior to having taken the candidacy examination in the graduate major program.

Consequently, doctoral students who have already taken their candidacy examination in a graduate major program generally are not eligible for admission to a dual-title graduate degree program.

Under no circumstances should students be encouraged to take coursework related to or recruited for admission to a dual-title graduate degree program that has not yet been approved by Graduate Council and adopted by the student’s graduate major program by means of a program change proposal submitted to and approved through the Graduate Council Curriculum Review process.

The dual-title area of study cannot exist as a separate (stand-alone) graduate degree program at Penn State, and the minor is not noted on the student's diploma and the student can qualify for a minor by taking the number and type of courses as described in the Penn State Graduate Degree Programs Bulletin. In the case of a dual-title degree program, the student must apply to and be admitted to the dual-title area of study. The student's diploma (master's and/or doctorate) carries the name of both the major and the dual-title offering.
A student can apply for a dual-title degree only after being enrolled in an existing graduate program. Such students have a graduate program in which the greater portion of the work is conducted, which constitutes the major program. A dual-title area of study requires a substantial amount of course work carried out under the supervision of a faculty advisor from the dual-title area. The student's diploma (for the master's degree and/or for the doctorate) will carry the name of both the graduate major and the dual-title offering. Students may complete only one dual-title in addition to a graduate major program of study within a single degree program.

A student can apply for a dual-title degree. The dual-title area of study cannot exist as a separate (graduate) degree program. The intent of any dual-title offering would be the addition of valuable course work not currently prescribed in an existing graduate degree program, and integration of the dual-title area of study into a thesis or dissertation (and exams (e.g., candidacy, comprehensive), in the case of doctoral programs).

Guidelines:

In order for a dual-title graduate degree program to be established, an existing graduate program must have previously agreed to the desirability of adding such a course of study, and will have detailed in writing the rationale and requirements of this course of study via a graduate program change proposal submitted centrally. The Graduate Council must approve any newly constituted dual-title graduate degree program and the addition of the dual-title offering to each graduate program that wishes to offer it.

The new dual-title area of study must be described in a the new graduate student handbook of the student's major program program proposal, outlining the nature of the dual-title degree, including the array of courses typically taken; expectations for participation by dual-title students (for example, dual-title students may be expected to regularly attend weekly seminars scheduled by the dual-title area of study); and detailing other structural and practical requirements of a dual-title degree. Proposals for new dual-title graduate degree programs should address the rationale for the creation of the dual-title degree. The proposal should show the advantages to be conferred by the dual-title graduate degree beyond those in existing alternative paths (e.g., graduate minors). A proposal might address such issues as the existence of current and sufficient demand by graduate students for such a program, and the enhanced employment opportunities for dual-title degree graduates. Graduate programs seeking to add (adopt) a new existing dual-title graduate degree program should similarly show the advantages to be conferred. Proposals for new dual-title graduate degree programs should be accompanied by at least one graduate program change proposal by a graduate major program proposing a program change to adopt the dual-title degree.

Graduate programs participating in a dual-title degree should develop sections in their graduate student handbooks that outline the nature of the dual-title degree; stipulate the array of courses typically taken; and detail other structural and practical requirements of a dual-title degree.

Other graduate programs wishing to adopt an existing dual-title program must submit a program change proposal to adopt the dual-title degree as described above, and must describe in
The Graduate School Council does not specify a minimum number of credits for the doctoral degree program, programs should include language in the proposal and in the student handbook that specifies any courses from the dual-title area of study that are approved as substitutions in the graduate program for post-master's students.

A graduate program change proposal to adopt a dual-title graduate degree program must address the following:

1. A listing of typical courses available (approved course title and course abbreviation/number) that are appropriate for the dual-title area of study should be provided.

2. A statement should be made regarding the minimum number of 500- or 800-level (or maximum number, in the and, in some case of 400-level) courses that must be taken in the dual-title area of study and the specific required or core courses for the dual-title field. Minimum credits for doctoral degrees must be at least 15 and for master's degrees at least 6.

3. A dual-title degree student (like single-title doctoral degree students) will take a candidacy examination that is administered by the graduate major program, but that also examines the student’s suitability for doctoral research in the dual-title field. Because students must first be admitted to a graduate major program of study before they may apply to and be considered for admission into a dual-title graduate degree program, dual-title graduate degree students may require an additional semester to fulfill requirements for both areas of study and, therefore, the candidacy examination may be delayed one semester beyond the normal period allowable. The normal period requires that “the examination may be given after at least 18 credits have been earned in graduate courses beyond the baccalaureate and must be taken within three semesters (summer sessions do not count) of entry into the doctoral program.”

4. A dual-title graduate degree student's candidacy examination committee will be composed of faculty from the graduate program, as well as at least one faculty member from the dual-title area of study. In some cases of programs with many overlapping interests, the designated dual-title faculty member may be appointed in the student's graduate program, but he or she may also hold a formal appointment with the dual-title area of study. Typically, the dual-title member will participate in constructing and grading candidacy examination questions in the dual-title area of study.

5. Similarly, a student who pursues a dual-title doctoral degree program will need to enlist faculty from the graduate major program as well as faculty from the dual-title area of study to serve on the doctoral committee. Faculty members who hold appointments in
both the graduate program and dual-title area of study may serve in a combined role. The
dual-title representative will participate in constructing and grading comprehensive
examination questions that cover the dual-title area of study as part of a unified
comprehensive examination with the major program administered to the student.
6. Administrative processes by which students will be admitted to and matriculate in the
dual-title degree program in a coordinated manner with the graduate program must be
delineated.

(Approved by Graduate Council 11/20/02)
(Revised and approved by the Graduate Council, May 13, 2009)
Revised by Graduate Council, [Fall 2014?]”
Proposed revisions to existing policy (with tracked changes accepted; “clean”)

“Dual-Title Graduate Degree Programs

Definition and Policy:

A dual-title graduate degree program is more than the addition of valuable coursework (minimally consisting of 15 credits for doctoral degrees and 6 credits for master’s degrees) not currently prescribed in an existing graduate degree program, as occurs with an option or a minor, but rather is a fully integrated program of study that begins with defining a research problem (or other culminating experience, as appropriate to the degree) that integrates both the graduate major and dual-title fields early in the program, and in the case of doctoral students, examining the students’ ability to conduct research in both fields at the first doctoral benchmark: the candidacy examination.

Students must apply and may be admitted to an existing dual-title graduate degree program only after being enrolled in an existing graduate program and, in the case of doctoral students, prior to having taken the candidacy examination in the graduate major program.

Consequently, doctoral students who have already taken their candidacy examination in a graduate major program generally are not eligible for admission to a dual-title graduate degree program.

UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES should students be encouraged to take coursework related to or recruited for admission to a dual-title graduate degree program that has not yet been approved by Graduate Council and adopted by the student’s graduate major program by means of a program change proposal submitted to and approved through the Graduate Council curricular review process.

The dual-title area of study cannot exist as a separate (stand-alone) graduate degree program at Penn State, and the student's diploma (for the master's degree and/or for the doctorate) will carry the name of both the graduate major and the dual-title offering. Students may complete only one dual-title in addition to a graduate major program of study within a single degree program.

Guidelines:

In order for a dual-title graduate degree program to be established, an existing graduate program must have previously agreed to the desirability of adding such a course of study, and will have detailed in writing the rationale and requirements of this course of study via a graduate program change proposal submitted centrally. Graduate Council must approve any newly constituted dual-title graduate degree program and the addition of the dual-title offering to each graduate program that wishes to offer it.
The new dual-title area of study must be described in a new graduate program proposal, outlining the nature of the dual-title degree, including the array of courses typically taken; expectations for participation by dual-title students (for example, dual-title students may be expected to regularly attend weekly seminars scheduled by the dual-title area of study); and detailing other structural and practical requirements of a dual-title degree. Proposals for new dual-title graduate degree programs also must address the rationale for the creation of the dual-title degree. The proposal must show the advantages to be conferred by the dual-title graduate degree beyond those in existing alternative paths (e.g., graduate minors). A proposal might address such issues as the existence of current and sufficient demand by graduate students for such a program, and the enhanced employment opportunities for dual-title degree graduates. Graduate programs seeking to add (adopt) a new dual-title graduate degree program similarly must show the advantages to be conferred. Proposals for new dual-title graduate degree programs must be accompanied by at least one graduate program change proposal by a graduate major program to adopt the dual-title degree.

Graduate programs participating in a dual-title degree must develop sections in their graduate student handbooks that outline the nature of the dual-title degree; stipulate the array of courses typically taken; and detail other structural and practical requirements of a dual-title degree.

A graduate program wishing to adopt an existing dual-title program must submit a program change proposal to adopt the dual-title degree as described above, and must describe in its graduate student handbook the dual-title offering requirements. The various formal requirements for achieving a dual-title degree should be stated in the graduate program’s student handbook, and care be taken to outline how satisfying these requirements can be rationally connected with satisfying the requirements in the graduate program.

Typically, a provision is made whereby a dual-title degree student at the master's level is relieved of some of the requirements of the graduate degree program, so that a different and substituted set of courses can be pursued. Any such course substitutions must be specified in the graduate program’s student handbook. Since Graduate Council does not specify a minimum number of credits for a doctoral degree program, programs must include language in the proposal and in the student handbook that specifies any courses from the dual-title area of study that are approved as substitutions in the graduate program for post-master's students.

A graduate program change proposal to adopt a dual-title graduate degree program must address the following:

1. A listing of typical courses available (approved course title and course abbreviation/number) that are appropriate for the dual-title area of study should be provided.
2. A statement should be made regarding the minimum number of 500- or 800-level (or maximum number, in the case of 400-level) credits that must be taken in the dual-title area of study and the specific required or core courses for the dual-title field. Minimum credits for doctoral degrees must be at least 15 and for master’s degrees at least 6.
3. A dual-title doctoral degree student (like single-title doctoral degree students) will take a candidacy examination that is administered by the graduate major program, but that also
examines the student’s suitability for doctoral research in the dual-title field. Because
students must first be admitted to a graduate major program of study before they may
apply to and be considered for admission into a dual-title graduate degree program, dual-
title graduate degree students may require an additional semester to fulfill requirements
for both areas of study and, therefore, the candidacy examination may be delayed one
semester beyond the normal period allowable. The normal period requires that “the
examination may be given after at least 18 credits have been earned in graduate courses
beyond the baccalaureate and must be taken within three semesters (summer sessions do
not count) of entry into the doctoral program.”
4. A dual-title graduate degree student's candidacy examination committee will be
composed of faculty from the graduate program, as well as at least one faculty member
from the dual-title area of study. In cases of programs with many overlapping interests,
the designated dual-title faculty member may be appointed in the student's graduate
program, but he or she also may hold a formal appointment with the dual-title area of
study. Typically, the dual-title member will participate in constructing and grading
candidacy examination questions in the dual-title area of study.
5. Similarly, a student who pursues a dual-title doctoral degree program will need to enlist
faculty from the graduate major program as well as faculty from the dual-title area of
study to serve on the doctoral committee. Faculty members who hold appointments in
both the graduate program and dual-title area of study may serve in a combined role. The
dual-title representative will participate in constructing and grading comprehensive
examination questions that cover the dual-title area of study as part of a unified
comprehensive examination with the major program administered to the student.
6. Administrative processes by which students will be admitted to and matriculate in the
dual-title degree program in a coordinated manner with the graduate program must be
delineated.

Approved by Graduate Council 11/20/02
Revised and approved by Graduate Council, May 13, 2009
Revised by Graduate Council, [Fall 2014?]"
Proposed New Criteria and Guidelines/Policy for Membership in the Graduate Faculty

Background/Justification

In Summer 2013, Jean Vasilatos-Younken, Interim Dean of the Graduate School, constituted an Ad Hoc Subcommittee of the Committee on Academic Standards to review existing categories of, criteria for, and privileges associated with Graduate Faculty membership (current criteria may be found at http://www.gradsch.psu.edu/index.cfm/policies/faculty/criteria/). The Subcommittee was asked to provide to the Committee recommendations for changes to existing guidelines, with an emphasis on reforming, as needed, the criteria and procedures for Graduate Faculty appointment.

The current delineation of Graduate Faculty in terms of the approval channel (i.e., Form A, Form B, and Form C) and the specification of the rights and responsibilities associated with each category of Graduate Faculty membership fail to meet the needs of graduate education at Penn State. The categories of membership do not correspond directly with the range of rights and responsibilities accruing to a member of the Graduate Faculty (for example, some Form B appointments have full rights and responsibilities equivalent to Form A appointments; other Form B appointments have restricted rights and responsibilities). In addition, the constraints on the role played by non-tenure line faculty and staff, particularly those who do not hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, undermine pursuit of the education goals of the institution. In particular, overly restrictive constraints on Graduate Faculty membership within professional master’s programs for persons holding strong professional credentials need to be addressed, as well as limitations placed on the Graduate Faculty rights and responsibilities of faculty who hold tenure-line positions but do not have the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State. With due consideration for oversight and attention to quality graduate education, the goal is to simplify and rationalize Graduate Faculty membership guidelines.

The proposed new guidelines/policy, presented on pages 3 through 9 of this document and summarized for Council members’ convenience in Attachment 1, are based on the Ad Hoc Subcommittee’s report to the Committee and are presented to Graduate Council by the Committee on Academic Standards with a motion to approve the new guidelines/policy and a second. For reference, the Committee’s final recommendations, including underlying rationale, that were used to draft the policy statement are included for reference starting on page 10 of this document.

Multiple administrative procedural revisions and system changes (reprogramming) will be required in order for the proposed criteria and guidelines/policy to be operationalized fully. One example is the conversion of all existing Graduate Faculty members to the new categories. While implementation is beyond the scope of the Committee, the Committee foresees the following:

(a) faculty currently appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form A will convert to Full Members; (b) faculty who are tenure line and currently appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form B will convert to Full Members; (c) faculty who are non-tenure
line and appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form B will convert to Associate Members; and (d) the Graduate Faculty membership status of faculty appointed under Form C will be granted a one-year grace period from the approval of the proposed revisions to the criteria and guidelines/policy to allow graduate programs to appoint the individuals, if appropriate, as Associate Members. If an individual is not appointed as an Associate Member, either by the originating graduate program or by another graduate program to which the individual contributes, the individual’s membership in the Graduate Faculty will expire at the end of the one-year grace period.

If approved, the new criteria and guidelines/policy would take effect beginning in Fall 2014.
Proposed New Graduate Faculty Criteria and Policy

Note: If approved, the policy statement starting below and ending on page 9 will replace the “Graduate Faculty Criteria” at http://www.gradsch.psu.edu/index.cfm/policies/faculty/criteria/; highlighted text below is current policy language that will remain intact (except for minor editorial updates as indicated by tracked changes).

[BEGINNING OF NEW POLICY STATEMENT]

The Graduate Faculty Criteria

Full Members have all the rights and responsibilities of Graduate Faculty membership; Associate Members have those rights and responsibilities that are subject to further oversight by graduate program heads.

Note - Graduate students are NOT eligible for nomination to the Graduate Faculty (any category) and are not allowed to teach graduate (500, 600, or 800-and-above) level courses. This includes, for example, running laboratory sections, providing feedback/answering questions, leading discussions, or grading papers or examinations related to graduate courses.

Graduate Faculty Rights and Responsibilities

The following roles potentially are served by members of the Graduate Faculty:

a. Chair doctoral committees (the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate)

b. Serve on Graduate Council

c. Vote on matters submitted by Graduate Council to members of the Graduate Faculty as a whole for vote (individual graduate programs retain the right to determine the allocation of voting privileges on local matters)

d. Serve as the head of a graduate program

e. Teach graduate (500, 600, and 800)-level courses

1 Graduate Council policies regarding the composition of graduate student committees can be found at http://bulletins.psu.edu/graduate/dgreerequirements/.
f. Serve on graduate students’ committees

g. Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students (the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate)

h. Advise graduate students on their course of study

i. Supervise the capstone project within a professional degree program

j. Develop graduate courses or programs

Graduate Faculty Categories

The two categories of Graduate Faculty membership, Full Member and Associate Member, distinguish between (a) tenure-line members of the faculty who are fully vested in all aspects of graduate education, and (b) non-tenure line or retired members of the faculty or staff who are deemed, through appropriate review and oversight, to meet a high bar for participation in aspects of graduate education. The following guidelines describe minimum requirements for appointment to the Graduate Faculty in both categories and expectations for periodic review for all members of the Graduate Faculty.

1. General Requirements

Graduate Faculty membership requires, at a minimum, that the individual hold a graduate degree. Exceptions to this requirement may be granted should an individual lacking a graduate degree have truly exceptional qualifications for Graduate Faculty membership, at the request of the head of the graduate program and upon review and approval by the college/school and the dean of the Graduate School. Such exceptions are expected to be rare.

No distinction is made between full-time and part-time faculty in the guidelines that follow.

2. Graduate Faculty – Full Member (tenured or tenure track faculty)

Faculty who are tenured or tenure track at any Penn State campus are granted membership on the Graduate Faculty with full rights and responsibilities (a–j above), contingent upon approval of the head of the graduate program to which the individual will contribute. Faculty who are tenured or tenure track in departments that do not offer a graduate degree may serve on the Graduate Faculty if nominated by the head of a graduate program; these faculty members can initiate a request for consideration for Graduate Faculty membership through the head of the appropriate graduate program or through the college/school administrator for graduate education in the relevant college/school.

Full Members exclusively have the following rights and responsibilities:
a. Chair doctoral committees (the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate)

b. Serve on Graduate Council

c. Vote on matters submitted by Graduate Council to members of the Graduate Faculty as a whole for vote (individual graduate programs retain the right to determine the allocation of voting privileges on local matters)

d. Serve as the head of a graduate program.

Reserving these roles for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold tenure-line appointments in academic programs ensures that oversight of graduate education, and in particular of the research doctoral and master’s degrees, remains the responsibility of the tenured or tenure track faculty of the graduate program. In cases where Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty are the most qualified individuals to direct professional graduate degree programs, the dean of the Graduate School may grant an exception to the requirement that leadership of graduate degree programs come from Full Members of the Graduate Faculty.

3. Graduate Faculty – Associate Member

Faculty who are not tenured or tenure track but who hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, who have a record of graduate-level teaching, and who can provide evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the graduate program are granted membership on the Graduate Faculty with the following subset of rights and responsibilities, subject to recommendation and periodic review by the graduate program to which the faculty member contributes (as noted above, some rights and responsibilities are reserved for Full Members of the Graduate Faculty):

e. Teach graduate (500, 600, and 800)-level courses

f. Serve on graduate students’ committees

g. Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students (the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate)

h. Advise graduate students on their course of study

i. Supervise the capstone project within a professional degree program

j. Develop graduate courses or programs
Departmental oversight of teaching assignments, graduate students’ committee membership, thesis/dissertation advising, graduate student advising, capstone project supervision, and curriculum development will ensure that Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty have the relevant expertise to execute any of these particular responsibilities. For example, Graduate Faculty Associate Member status would grant the right to teach any graduate-level course, subject to specific review of assignments within the graduate program.

Exceptions may be requested to allow individuals who do not meet all three criteria for Associate membership (highest degree, graduate-level teaching, and research or professional activity) to be considered by the dean of the Graduate School for Associate membership (see “Associate Member – University Approval” in #4 below).

Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty may be granted permission to chair a master’s or doctoral committee or supervise research, pending favorable review of a request for Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty who have exceptional qualifications to perform this role. Such requests must be initiated by the head of the graduate program and are subject to approval by the college/school administrator for graduate education and the dean of the Graduate School.

4. Procedures for Appointment to the Graduate Faculty

**Full Member – Program Approval:** Appointment to the Graduate Faculty as a Full Member by the dean of the Graduate School follows appointment to a tenure-line faculty position, contingent upon the approval (by signature) of the head of the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. Once an individual is appointed to a tenure-line faculty position and approved by the head of the graduate program for appointment as a Full Member of the Graduate Faculty, notification is sent by the head of the graduate program to the Office of the Dean of the Graduate School and includes the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute.

**Associate Member – Program Approval:** When non-tenure line nominees (a) hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, (b) have a record of graduate-level teaching, and (c) provide evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the graduate program, appointment to the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member by the dean of the Graduate School follows appointment to the faculty, contingent upon the approval (by signature) of the head of the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. Once an individual is appointed to a non-tenure line faculty position and approved by the head of the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute, notification is sent by the head of the graduate program to the Office of the Dean of the Graduate School and includes the program to which the individual will contribute. Emeriti tenured faculty automatically will transition from Full to Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty, with the added provision that the faculty member may (with consent of the head of the graduate program) continue to chair a specific doctoral committee or supervise an individual student’s research, provided that he/she served in the role of committee chair or research supervisor prior to retirement.
Associate Member – University Approval: When non-tenure line nominees (a) do not hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, (b) do not have a record of graduate-level teaching, and/or (c) do not provide evidence of research or professional activity, the head of the graduate program must justify to the dean of the Graduate School appointment on the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member. The graduate program is responsible for making a case for Graduate Faculty Associate Membership, identifying how the nominee’s education, teaching experience, and/or research and professional activities offset the absence of other indicators of qualifications for Graduate Faculty membership. Graduate programs must, as part of this nomination process, indicate whether an individual nominated should be subject to standard or provisional periodic review (as defined subsequently). The nomination form, resume/curriculum vitae, and justification for the appointment must be signed by the head of the graduate program and, where appropriate, the department head; reviewed and signed by the college/school administrator for graduate education (following the college’s internal processes, which may include review by a faculty committee); and submitted to the dean of the Graduate School for review. The dean of the Graduate School has the discretion to (a) approve membership in the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member subject to standard review; (b) approve membership in the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member subject to provisional review; or (c) not approve membership in the Graduate Faculty.

5. Periodic Review

Membership in the Graduate Faculty includes a process of periodic review for all members of the Graduate Faculty, including those who are tenured or tenure track, which could result in a faculty member’s loss of Graduate Faculty membership, as described below. As part of each review, consideration should be given to all of an individual’s activities in all of the graduate programs across the University to which he/she contributes.

Full Member Review: All tenure-line members of the faculty are subject to annual review at the department level and reviews at the college/University level corresponding with the 2nd year, 4th year, tenure (6th year), and post-tenure reviews. Performance of responsibilities as a full member of the Graduate Faculty will be a standard part of these reviews.

Associate Member Standard Review: Non-tenure line nominees are appointed to the Graduate Faculty for the period of their affiliation with the University. All non-tenure line nominees are subject to annual review at the program/department level. Performance of responsibility as an Associate Member of the Graduate Faculty will be a standard part of these reviews.

Associate Member Provisional Review: For Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty appointed subject to provisional review, in addition to annual review at the program/department level, review of the appointment by the dean of the Graduate School must occur prior to the third year (with the period of time to be determined by the head of the graduate program or the dean of the Graduate School upon appointment). A provisional review involves an evaluation of the faculty member by the head of the
graduate program (or department head) and a portfolio documenting the faculty member’s performance in the execution of roles relevant to Graduate Faculty membership. This dossier is reviewed by the college/school administrator for graduate education and submitted to the dean of the Graduate School for review. The dean of the Graduate School has discretion to (a) remove the faculty member from the Graduate Faculty; (b) grant continued Graduate Faculty membership as an Associate Member subject to provisional review, or (c) grant Graduate Faculty membership as an Associate Member subject to standard review.

**Tenure in the Graduate Faculty**

A member may be dropped from the rolls of the Graduate Faculty by the dean of the Graduate School upon the recommendation or concurrence of the program chairperson and with the concurrence of the college evaluation committee if he or she fails to participate significantly in the graduate affairs of the University or has no record of continuing scholarly or creative activity. A member may be dismissed from the Graduate Faculty by the dean for failure to maintain appropriate standards of professional ethics as described in University Policy AD-47. The action will be contingent upon the recommendation of the ad hoc investigatory committee, consistent with University Policy RA-10. Criteria for such dismissal include: ethical misconduct, including fraud, fabrication, falsification, plagiarism, and other serious deviation from accepted practices within the roles of teacher, researcher/scholar, colleague, and member of the University; failure to adhere to the principles of coauthorship in scholarly reports, papers, and publications (ref. RA-13[IP]02); or failure to exercise utmost good faith in all transactions touching upon the individual's duties with and on behalf of the University, so as to avoid conflict between the interests of the University and the member of the Graduate Faculty (ref. HR-91).

**Administrative Guidelines**

**Appeal Procedure**

The dean of the Graduate School shall be the final appeal authority for any recommendation of the evaluation committee or program head, and may establish such ad hoc procedures in each case as deemed appropriate.

**Temporary Appointments of Visiting Faculty**

Based on the criteria for Graduate Faculty Form B or Form CFull and Associate Membership above, these temporary appointments may be made for the period of affiliation by the dean of the Graduate School on the recommendation of the program chairperson.
Teaching by Non-members of the Graduate Faculty

Under special circumstances, on recommendation of the program chairperson and on approval of the dean of the Graduate School, non-graduate faculty members may be approved to teach specific 500- and/or 800-level courses.

- Recommendation form for approval to teach 500- or 800-level course (by non-members of the Graduate Faculty)

Approved by Graduate Council, May 11, 2005

Revised by Graduate Council, Spring 2014

[END OF NEW POLICY STATEMENT]
Final Recommendations of the Graduate Council Committee on Academic Standards regarding Graduate Faculty Criteria and Policy

Note: The following information includes rationale and other explanatory statements for Graduate Council members’ reference during discussion/voting.

Criteria:
The Committee’s recommendations attend to the following strategic priorities:

1. Preserve the category of Graduate Faculty membership pertaining to participation in the research doctoral and master’s degrees.

2. Accommodate graduate degrees other than the research doctoral and master’s degree (professional doctoral and master’s degrees, both residential and online)

3. Recognize the diverse responsibilities fulfilled by members of the Graduate Faculty.

4. Ensure adequate and appropriate oversight of Graduate Faculty membership, with an emphasis on maintaining excellence in all forms of graduate education.

A Review of Current Graduate Faculty Rights and Responsibilities:
Current policy identifies five rights and responsibilities of members of the Graduate Faculty (a, b, c, e, and f). Additional roles potentially filled by members of the Graduate Faculty are not currently encompassed in the guidelines (d, g, h, i, and j). In total, then, the following roles potentially are served by members of the Graduate Faculty:

a. Chair doctoral committees

b. Serve on Graduate Council

c. Vote on matters submitted to the Graduate Faculty for vote

d. Serve as the head of a graduate program

e. Teach graduate (500, 600, and 800)-level courses

f. Serve on graduate students’ committees

1 Graduate Council policies regarding the composition of graduate student committees can be found here: http://bulletins.psu.edu/graduate/degreerequirements/.

2 This item refers to matters submitted by Graduate Council to members of the Graduate Faculty as a whole; programs retain the right to determine the allocation of voting privileges on local matters.
g. Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students
h. Advise graduate students on their course of study
i. Supervise the capstone project within a professional degree program
j. Develop graduate courses or programs

To review, the current guidelines specify the following allocation of rights and responsibilities (referring only to a, b, c, e, and f in the preceding list):

- Tenure-line members of the Graduate Faculty have all rights and responsibilities, as do full-time fixed term members of the Graduate Faculty holding the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State (i.e., a subset of the individuals appointed to the Graduate Faculty under Form B).
- Retired and emeritus/a faculty members have the first two rights and responsibilities (e–f) and they may chair doctoral committees (a) if service on that committee preceded retirement.
- Non-tenure line faculty and staff who are not full time but who have the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State have the first two rights and responsibilities (e–f) only.
- Non-tenure line faculty and staff who do not hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State may not perform roles a, b, c, or f, and they are limited to teaching only specifically approved 800-level courses.

Recommendations:

The Committee proposes the creation of two clearly distinct categories of Graduate Faculty membership. These categories distinguish between (a) tenure-line members of the faculty who are fully vested in all aspects of graduate education, and (b) non-tenure line or retired members of the faculty who are deemed, through appropriate review and oversight, to meet a high bar for participation in aspects of graduate education. The Committee further proposes revised guidelines for appointment to the Graduate Faculty, and suggests a process of periodic review for all members of the Graduate Faculty.³

³If adopted, these recommendations will require conversion of current membership on the Graduate Faculty. While implementation is beyond the scope of the Committee, the Committee foresees the following: (a) faculty currently appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form A will convert to Full Members; (b) faculty who are tenure line and currently appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form B will convert to Full Members; (c) faculty who are non-tenure line and appointed as members of the Graduate Faculty under Form B will convert to Associate Members; and (d) the Graduate Faculty membership status of faculty appointed under Form C will be granted a one-year grace period from the approval of the proposed revisions to the criteria and guidelines/policy to allow graduate programs to appoint the individuals, if appropriate, as Associate Members. If an individual is not appointed as an Associate Member, either by the
1. General Requirements

The Committee recommends that Graduate Faculty membership requires, at a minimum, that the individual hold a graduate degree. Exceptions to this requirement may be granted should an individual lacking a graduate degree have truly exceptional qualifications for Graduate Faculty membership, at the request of the graduate program and upon review and approval by the College and the dean of the Graduate School. Such exceptions are expected to be rare.

The Committee makes no distinction between full-time and part-time faculty in the recommendations that follow.

2. Graduate Faculty – Full Member (tenured or tenure track faculty)

The Committee recommends that faculty who are tenured or tenure track at any of the Penn State campuses be granted membership on the Graduate Faculty with full rights and responsibilities (a–j above), contingent upon approval of the head of the graduate program to which the individual will contribute.\(^4\) The Committee further notes that Full Members exclusively have the following rights and responsibilities:

a. Chair doctoral committees\(^5\)

b. Serve on Graduate Council

c. Vote on matters submitted to the Graduate Faculty for vote

d. Serve as the head of a graduate program\(^6\)

---

\(^4\) Faculty who are tenured or tenure track in departments that do not offer a graduate degree may serve on the Graduate Faculty if nominated by the head of a graduate program. These faculty members can initiate a request for consideration for Graduate Faculty membership through the head of the appropriate graduate program or through the college/school administrator for graduate education in the relevant college/school.

\(^5\) In so far as these revised guidelines extend full membership on the Graduate Faculty to tenure-line faculty who may not hold the highest degree offered by a graduate program, the Committee notes that the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate.

\(^6\) In cases where Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty are the most qualified individuals to direct professional graduate degree programs, the dean of the Graduate School may grant an exception to the requirement that leadership of graduate degree programs come from Full Members of the Graduate Faculty.
Reserving these roles for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold tenure-line appointments in academic programs ensures that oversight of graduate education, and in particular of the research doctoral and master’s degrees, remains the responsibility of the tenured or tenure track faculty of the graduate program.

3. Graduate Faculty – Associate Member

The Committee recommends that faculty who are not tenured or tenure track be granted membership on the Graduate Faculty with a subset of rights and responsibilities, subject to recommendation and periodic review by the graduate programs to which the faculty member contributes. As noted, some rights and responsibilities are reserved for full members of the Graduate Faculty. The Committee recommends that the following rights and responsibilities be granted to Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty:

e. Teach graduate (500, 600, and 800)-level courses
f. Serve on graduate students’ committees
g. Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students
h. Advise graduate students on their course of study
i. Supervise the capstone project within a professional degree program
j. Develop graduate courses or programs

It is the position of the Committee that departmental oversight of teaching assignments, graduate students’ committee membership, thesis/dissertation advising, student advising, capstone project supervision, and curriculum development will ensure that Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty have the relevant expertise to execute any of these particular responsibilities. Thus, the Committee finds it unnecessary and, indeed, a source of confusion to delineate categories of Graduate Faculty membership that designate who may or may not perform these specific activities. For example, Graduate Faculty Associate Member status would grant the right to teach any graduate-level course, subject to specific review of assignments within the graduate program. Accordingly, the Committee proposes a single category—Associate Member of the Graduate Faculty—for non-tenure line faculty and staff, subject to periodic review as detailed subsequently. The Committee further notes that Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty may be granted permission to chair a master’s or doctoral committee or supervise research, pending favorable review of a request for Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty who have exceptional qualifications to perform this role. Such requests must be initiated by the

7 The Committee notes that the roles of committee chair and research adviser require the individual to hold, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working; e.g., supervision of Ph.D. dissertation research and/or chairing a Ph.D. committee is reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty who hold a research doctorate.
head of the graduate program and are subject to approval by the college/school administrator for graduate education and the dean of the Graduate School. 8

4. Appointment to the Graduate Faculty

While the Committee recommends simplifying the distinctions among non-tenure line members of the Graduate Faculty with regard to the roles that they may fill in graduate education (per recommendation #3 above), the Committee proposes multiple pathways for membership on the Graduate Faculty. The criteria and procedures outlined below are intended to allow expedient approval where appropriate and to ensure careful scrutiny when it is merited. The intention is to implement a sieve approval process wherein clearly qualified nominees are approved efficiently, and other nominees are carefully and appropriately reviewed.

In general, the Committee strongly recommends that review processes commence once an intention to hire is formed, rather than after the appointment period begins. For individuals hired expressly to fill roles reserved for members of the Graduate Faculty, the practice of waiting until the appointment period begins to review requests for Graduate Faculty membership creates an unnecessary compression of the timeline and the process, and potentially compromises adequate review.

**Full Member – Program Approval:** The Committee recommends that appointment to the Graduate Faculty as a Full Member by the dean of the Graduate School follow appointment to a tenure-line faculty position, contingent upon the approval (by signature) of the head of the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. Once an individual is appointed to a tenure-line faculty position and approved for appointment as a Full Member of the Graduate Faculty by the head of the graduate program, notification is sent by the head of the graduate program to the Office of the Dean of the Graduate School and includes the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. The position of the Committee is that the stringent process of review and the criteria for hiring on a tenure-line appointment in a program that offers graduate degrees is sufficient to justify membership on the Graduate Faculty, irrespective of terminal degree status. Tenure-line members of the faculty have vested responsibility for ensuring the integrity and excellence of graduate education, and de facto membership on the Graduate Faculty recognizes the obligation all members of the tenure-line faculty have with regard to graduate education. As noted subsequently, the Committee recommends a process of periodic review for all members of the Graduate Faculty, including those who are tenured or tenure track, which could result in a faculty member’s loss of Graduate Faculty membership.

---

8 The proposed guidelines do not revise the option of allowing individual faculty to teach graduate courses through the “approval to teach” granted by the dean of the Graduate School. Just as the Graduate School may grant “special member” status that allows non-members of the Graduate Faculty to serve on doctoral committees, so may the Graduate School continue to grant “approval to teach” graduate courses to non-members of the Graduate Faculty.
Associate Member – Program Approval: When non-tenure line nominees (a) hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, (b) have a record of graduate-level teaching, and (c) provide evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the graduate program, the Committee recommends that appointment to the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member by the dean of the Graduate School follow appointment to the faculty, contingent upon the approval (by signature) of the head of the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. Once an individual is appointed to a non-standing faculty position and approved for appointment as an Associate Member of the Graduate Faculty by the head of the graduate program, notification is sent by the head of the graduate program to the Office of the Dean of the Graduate School and includes the graduate program to which the faculty member will contribute. It is the position of the Committee that non-tenure line nominees meeting all three of these criteria, as evaluated by the head of the graduate program, constitute sufficient basis for a program appointment to membership on the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member. Emeriti tenured faculty will automatically transition from Full to Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty, with the added provision that the faculty member may (with consent of the head of the graduate program) continue to chair a specific doctoral committee or supervise an individual student’s research, provided that he/she served in the role of committee chair or research supervisor prior to retirement.

Associate Member – University Approval: When non-tenure line nominees (a) do not hold the highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, (b) do not have a record of graduate-level teaching, or (c) do not provide evidence of research or professional activity, the head of the graduate program must justify to the dean of the Graduate School appointment on the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member. The Committee does not mean to suggest that lacking any one of these qualifications should bar a faculty member from the Graduate Faculty. But rather, the Committee seeks to flag these nominations for more thorough review. The graduate program is responsible for making a case for Graduate Faculty Associate Membership, identifying how the nominee’s education, teaching experience, and/or research and professional activities offset the absence of other indicators of qualifications for Graduate Faculty membership. Graduate programs should, as part of this nomination process, indicate whether an individual nominated should be subject to standard or provisional periodic review (as defined subsequently). The nomination form, resume/curriculum vitae, and justification for the appointment must be signed by the head of the graduate program and, where appropriate, the department head; reviewed and signed by the college/school administrator for graduate education (following the college’s internal processes, which may include review by a faculty committee); and submitted to the dean of the Graduate School for review. The dean of the Graduate School has the discretion to (a) approve membership in the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member, subject to standard review; (b) approve membership in the Graduate Faculty as an Associate Member, subject to provisional review; or (c) not approve membership in the Graduate Faculty.
5. Periodic Review

The Committee recommends that all appointments to the Graduate Faculty be reviewed periodically as part of Penn State’s standard cycle for performance reviews. As part of each review, consideration should be given to all of an individual’s activities in all of the graduate programs across the University to which he/she contributes.

Full Member Review: All tenure-line members of the faculty are subject to annual review at the departmental level and reviews at the college/university level corresponding with the 2nd year, 4th year, tenure (6th year), and post-tenure reviews. The Committee recommends that performance of responsibilities as a full member of the Graduate Faculty be a standard part of these reviews. Language in the current guidelines requires no revision.9

Associate Member Standard Review: Non-tenure line members of the faculty are appointed to the Graduate Faculty for the period of their affiliation with the University. All non-tenure line members of the faculty are subject to annual review at the program/department level. The Committee recommends that performance of responsibility as an Associate Member of the Graduate Faculty be a standard part of these reviews.

Associate Member Provisional Review: For Associate Members of the Graduate Faculty appointed subject to provisional review, in addition to annual review at the program/department level, review of the appointment by the dean of the Graduate School must occur prior to the third year (with the period of time to be determined by the head of the graduate program or the Graduate School upon appointment). A provisional review involves an evaluation of the faculty member by the head of the graduate program (or department head) and a portfolio documenting the faculty member’s performance in the execution of roles relevant to Graduate Faculty membership. This dossier is reviewed by the college/school administrator for graduate education and submitted to the dean of the Graduate School for review. The dean of the Graduate School has discretion to (a) remove the faculty member from the Graduate Faculty; (b) grant continued Graduate Faculty membership as an Associate Member subject to provisional review, or (c) grant Graduate Faculty membership as an Associate Member subject to standard review.

Concluding Remarks

It is the opinion of the Committee that the aforementioned revisions to Graduate Faculty membership roles, criteria, and procedures for appointment and review constitute much needed guidelines concerning tenure in the Graduate Faculty and procedures for dropping a member from the rolls of the Graduate Faculty can be found at http://www.gradsch.psu.edu/index.cfm/policies/faculty/criteria/
improvement to current guidelines. The distinction between Full and Associate members of the Graduate Faculty brings clarity to a currently complicated array of appointments. Whereas Full Members would have all the rights and responsibilities of Graduate Faculty membership, Associate Members would have only those rights and responsibilities that are subject to further oversight by graduate program heads. Because those local layers of oversight are in place, the Committee sees no need to further segregate access to the various Associate Member rights and responsibilities as a function of appointment status. In addition, the Committee proposes multiple channels for appointment, to ensure efficient expedited appointment of well-qualified faculty and careful multi-layered review when, and only when, it is warranted. These procedures for appointment to the Graduate Faculty are complemented by alternative procedures for review, which are similarly tailored to ensure an expeditious process or a more thorough review, as appropriate.

The Committee wishes to thank the members of the Ad Hoc Subcommittee:

Denise Solomon, Chair of the Ad Hoc Subcommittee for Review of Graduate Faculty Membership; Professor of Communication Arts & Sciences, College of the Liberal Arts

Jon Nussbaum, Chair of the Graduate Council Committee on Academic Standards, Professor of Communication Arts and Sciences and Human Development and Family Studies, College of the Liberal Arts

James Kasting, Member of the Graduate Council Committee on Academic Standards, Evan Pugh Professor, Department of Geosciences, College of Earth and Mineral Sciences

James Rosenberger, Professor of Statistics, Eberly College of Science

Phillip LaPlante, Professor of Software Engineering, School of Graduate Professional Studies, Penn State Great Valley

William Doan, Professor of Theatre and Women’s Studies, College of Arts and Architecture

Michael Verderame, Associate Dean for Graduate Studies, Professor of Medicine, and Microbiology and Immunology, College of Medicine

Paul Clark, Professor and Head of Labor Studies and Employment Relations & Health Policy Administration, College of the Liberal Arts
CRITERIA FOR MEMBERSHIP

Tenure or tenure-track
Adjunct, fixed term, affiliate, part-time, non-tenure track, emeriti

APPROVAL PATH FOR APPOINTMENT

Follows appt to tenure-line faculty position w/approval of graduate program head
By evaluation of graduate program head with the following criteria: holds highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, has record of graduate-level teaching, provides evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the graduate program
By evaluation of the Dean of the Graduate School when any one of the above indicators of qualification is not met; Dean of the Graduate School then determines periodic review requirements (standard or provisional)

RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES

Chair doctoral committees (if individual holds, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working)
Serve on Graduate Faculty committees
Serve on Graduate Students' committees
Teach Graduate-Level (500, 600, or 800) Courses
Serve as head of a Graduate Program
Vote on matters submitted by Graduate Council to the Graduate Faculty for vote
Serve on Graduate Council
Chair doctoral committees (if individual holds, minimally, the degree toward which the student is working)

PERIODIC REVIEW PROCESS

Standard departmental annual performance review
Provisional review, as determined during the appointment process at the discretion of the Dean of the Graduate School

GRADUATE FACULTY NOMINATION CRITERIA & RESPONSIBILITIES

Requirements (standard or provisional)
Qualification is not met; Dean of the Graduate School then determines periodic review
By evaluation of the Dean of the Graduate School when any one of the above indicators of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the Graduate Program is not met, the Graduate Program Head in the field offers the position to Penn State's faculty. The faculty member must hold the highest degree appropriate to the Graduate Program and must provide evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the Graduate Program
By evaluation of the Graduate Program Head with the following criteria: holds highest degree in the field offered by Penn State, provides evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the Graduate Program, and has record of graduate-level teaching
Follows appointment to tenure-line faculty position w/approval of Graduate Program Head

APPROVAL PATH FOR APPOINTMENT

Adjunct, fixed term, affiliate, part-time, non-tenure track, emeriti
Tenure, or tenure-track

CRITERIA FOR MEMBERSHIP & RESPONSIBILITIES

Full Member
Assoc. Member

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minimum Education Credentials</th>
<th>FULL MEMBER</th>
<th>ASSOCIATE MEMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graduate Degree</td>
<td>Graduate Degree</td>
<td>Adjunct, fixed-term, affiliate, part-time, non-tenure line, emeriti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Faculty Appointment Type</th>
<th>FULL MEMBER</th>
<th>ASSOCIATE MEMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Tenure-line             | Head of graduate program; follows appointment to tenure-line faculty position | Head of graduate program** when the following indicators of eligibility are met:  
1. Must hold highest degree in the field offered at Penn State  
2. Must have record of graduate-level teaching  
3. Must show evidence of research or professional activity appropriate for participation in the graduate program  
** Dean of the Graduate School when any one of the above indicators of eligibility are not met |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approval Path for Appointment to the Graduate Faculty</th>
<th>FULL MEMBER</th>
<th>ASSOCIATE MEMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Standard departmental-level annual review</td>
<td>Standard departmental-level annual review with same conditions as approval process above.</td>
<td>Provisional review, as determined during the appointment process at the discretion of the Dean of the Graduate School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periodic Review Process</th>
<th>FULL MEMBER</th>
<th>ASSOCIATE MEMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRADUATE FACULTY RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>FULL MEMBER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Teach graduate-level (500, 600, or 800) courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve on graduate students’ committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Advise graduate students on their course of study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supervise capstone projects within a professional degree program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Develop graduate courses and programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chair doctoral committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve on Graduate Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vote on matters submitted by Graduate Council to the Graduate Faculty for vote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve as head of a graduate program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ASSOCIATE MEMBER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Teach graduate-level (500, 600, or 800) courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve on graduate students’ committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Serve as thesis or dissertation research adviser for research master’s and doctoral students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Advise graduate students on their course of study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supervise capstone projects within a professional degree program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Develop graduate courses and programs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>